

District: Town of Canton
 School Name: William H. Galvin Middle School
 Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic
 Date: April 17, 2024

Recommendation

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the Town of Canton (the “District”), as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to proceed into Schematic Design to replace the existing William H. Galvin Middle School with a new facility serving grades 5-8 on the site of the existing school. MSBA staff has reviewed the Feasibility Study and accepts the District’s Preferred Schematic.

District Information	
District Name	Town of Canton
Elementary School(s)	Rodman Early Childhood Center (PK) Dean S Luce (K-5) John F Kennedy (K-5) Lt Peter M Hansen (K-5)
Middle School(s)	William H. Galvin Middle (6-8)
High School(s)	Canton High (9-12, SP)
Priority School Name	William H Galvin Middle School
Type of School	Middle School
Grades Served	6-8
Year Opened	1971
Existing Square Footage	131,903
Additions	N/A
Acreage of Site	33.8 acres
Building Issues	The District identified deficiencies in the following areas: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Mechanical systems – Electrical systems – Plumbing systems – Building envelope – Windows – Roof In addition to the physical plant issues, the District reported that the existing facility does not support the delivery of its educational program as well as existing and projected overcrowding.
Original Design Capacity	850
2023-2024 Enrollment	742
Agreed Upon Enrollment	Study Enrollment includes the following configurations: 1,020 students in grades 5-8 (Preferred Schematic) 760 students in grades 6-8
Enrollment Specifics	Contingent upon the Board’s approval of the Preferred Schematic, the District will sign a Design Enrollment Certification for 1,020 students in grades 5-8.

District Information	
Total Project Budget – Debt Exclusion Anticipated	Yes

MSBA Board Votes	
Invitation to Eligibility Period	March 2, 2022
Invitation to Feasibility Study	October 26, 2022
Preferred Schematic Authorization	On April 24, 2024 Board agenda
Project Scope & Budget Authorization	District is targeting Board authorization on August 28, 2024
Feasibility Study Reimbursement Rate (Incentive points are not applicable)	47.21%

Consultants	
Owner’s Project Manager (the “OPM”)	Leftfield, LLC
Designer	Ai3 Architects, LLC

Discussion

The existing William H. Galvin Middle School is a 132,000 square-foot facility located on a 33.8-acre site, shared with one of the District’s three elementary schools, currently serving students in grades 6 through 8. The original building was constructed in 1971 and has remained unchanged other than a small modular-construction addition in 2002.

The District’s Statement of Interest (“SOI”) identified numerous deficiencies in the existing facility associated with the following: outdated mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems; building envelope; accessibility issues; overcrowding; and existing spaces are not conducive for delivering the District’s educational program.

As part of the Feasibility Study, the MSBA accepted the District’s request to explore options that include relocating grade 5 into the middle school resulting in the following study enrollments: 760 students in grades 6-8; and 1,020 students in grades 5-8.

In conjunction with its consultants, the District performed a comprehensive assessment of the existing conditions and the educational program and received input from educators, administrators, and facilities personnel. Based on the findings of this effort, the District and its consultants initially studied nine (9) preliminary options including: one (1) code upgrade option, four (4) addition/renovation options, and four (4) new construction options, as presented below.

Option	Description of Preliminary Options
1	Code upgrade / base repair only to the existing Galvin Middle School facility with an estimated total project cost ranging from \$122.8 million to \$135.5 million.
2	Addition / renovation for 760 students in grades 6-8 at the existing Galvin Middle School facility (no auditorium), with an estimated total project cost ranging from \$192.1 million to \$212.3 million.

3	Addition / renovation for 760 students in grades 6-8 at the existing Galvin Middle School facility (includes an auditorium), with an estimated total project cost ranging from \$204.9 million to \$226.5 million.
4	New construction for 760 students in grades 6-8 at the existing Galvin Middle School site (no auditorium), with an estimated total project cost ranging from \$163.2 million to \$180.4 million.
5	New construction for 760 students in grades 6-8 at the existing Galvin Middle School site (includes an auditorium), with an estimated total project cost ranging from \$176.8 million to \$195.5 million.
6	Addition / renovation for 1,020 students in grades 5-8 at the existing Galvin Middle School facility (no auditorium), with an estimated total project cost ranging from \$215.2 million to \$237.8 million.
7	Addition / renovation for 1,020 students in grades 5-8 at the existing Galvin Middle School facility (includes an auditorium), with an estimated total project cost ranging from \$229.7 million to \$253.9 million.
8	New construction for 1,020 students in grades 5-8 at the existing Galvin Middle School site (no auditorium), with an estimated total project cost ranging from \$185.9 million to \$205.5 million.
9	New construction for 1,020 students in grades 5-8 at the existing Galvin Middle School site (includes an auditorium), with an estimated total project cost ranging from \$199.9 million to \$220.9 million.

As a result of this analysis, the District determined that all nine (9) options would be considered for further evaluation. However, subsequent to the evaluation of preliminary options, the District determined that “Option 2” and “Option 3” would not be considered for further evaluation because these options are anticipated to result in significant disruption to ongoing education during phased construction, and these options do not support the inclusion of 5th grade students.

The District determined that “Option 6” would not be considered for further evaluation because it is anticipated that this option would result in significant disruption to ongoing education during phased construction and this option does not provide an auditorium.

Additionally, the District further developed “Option 7” into two options referred to as “Options 7a and 7b”; and further developed “Option 9” into two options referred to as “Options 9b and 9e”.

MSBA staff and the District agreed to explore the following eight (8) options for further development and consideration in the final evaluation and development of preliminary design pricing, as presented below, including: one (1) code upgrade option, two (2) addition/renovation options, and five (5) new construction options.

Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing for Final Evaluation of Options

Option (Description)	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sq. ft.)	Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sq. ft.)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sq. ft.)	Estimated Total Project Costs
Option 1: (Code Upgrade for grades 6-8)	131,903	131,903 \$527/sq. ft.	N/A	\$7,155,095	\$76,700,952 \$581/sq. ft.	\$95,876,191
Option 4: (New construction for grades 6-8, no auditorium)	174,935	N/A	174,935 \$737/sq. ft.	\$20,988,701	\$149,919,295 \$857/sq. ft.	\$187,399,118
Option 5: (New construction for grades 6-8, with an auditorium)	185,435	N/A	185,435 \$769/sq. ft.	\$23,209,045	\$165,778,860 \$894/sq. ft.	\$207,223,613
Option 7a: (Addition/ renovation for grades 5-8, with an auditorium)	213,473	131,903 \$596/sq. ft.	81,570 \$945/sq. ft.	\$25,333,709	\$181,082,475 \$848/sq. ft.	\$226,353,093
Option 7b: (Addition/ renovation for grades 5-8, with an auditorium)	222,900	36,600 \$643/sq. ft.	186,300 \$798/sq. ft.	\$26,342,699	\$198,620,048 \$891/sq. ft.	\$248,275,061
Option 8: (New construction for grades 5-8, no auditorium)	204,400	N/A	204,400 \$710/sq. ft.	\$25,034,912	\$170,060,800 \$832/sq. ft.	\$212,576,000
Option 9b: (New construction for grades 5-8, with an auditorium)	218,350	N/A	218,350 \$750/sq. ft.	\$26,089,051	\$189,895,221 \$870/sq. ft.	\$237,369,026
Option 9e: (New construction for grades 5-8, with an auditorium) ***	218,350	N/A	218,350 \$726/sq. ft.	\$27,759,578	\$186,224,907 \$853/sq. ft.	\$232,781,134

* Marked up construction costs

** Does not include construction contingency

*****District's Preferred Schematic**

The District has selected “Option 9e” as its Preferred Schematic to proceed into Schematic Design as the District has determined that this option best meets the needs of the District’s educational program. The District also indicated that the proposed design provides the desired program goals and adjacencies to allow for grade-level teaming and collaboration and provides ample natural light. Additionally, the building footprint allows for a campus approach with the adjacent elementary school.

“Option 1” was not selected by the District because the existing facility does not meet the needs of the District’s educational program and would result in significant disruption to ongoing education during construction. The District also indicated that this option would result in one of the longest construction durations, and it does not support the inclusion of 5th grade students.

“Option 4” was not selected by the District because this option does not support the inclusion of 5th grade students and does not provide an auditorium.

Although “Option 5” provides an auditorium, this option was not selected by the District because it does not support the inclusion of 5th grade students.

“Option 7a” was not selected by the District because this option does not achieve many of the goals identified in the District’s educational program and would result in significant disruption to ongoing education during the phased construction. The District also indicated that the layout results in a larger building footprint and does not support the separation of grades to successfully implement a 5-8 grade level configuration.

“Option 7b” was not selected by the District because this option would result in significant disruption to ongoing education during the phased construction. The District also indicated that the proposed location of the gymnasium on the second floor was less desirable and limits the connection to outdoor playfields. Also, the large building footprint and proposed central placement on the site would not utilize the site as efficiently in comparison to the new construction options.

“Option 8” was not selected by the District because this option does not provide an auditorium.

Although “Option 9b” meets some of the goals of the District’s educational program, this option was not selected by the District as this option does not achieve the goals for desired level of daylighting to interior spaces. The District also indicated that this option does not provide the desired grade-level teaming and collaboration when compared to “Option 9e”.

The District presented its proposed Preferred Schematic to the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee (“FAS”) on March 13, 2024. At that meeting, members of the FAS discussed the following items: appreciation of the District’s Educational Program, including professional learning opportunities, inclusion of world language as a core subject area, drama programming and the opt-in/opt-out advanced math curriculum; clarification of library/media center staffing and opportunities to integrate world language programming at lower grade levels; distribution of Special Education spaces and DESE submittal process; further development of the 5th grade wing; opportunities to furnish and equip collaboration spaces; use of the proposed auditorium and potential design considerations for more intimate performances; building massing and opportunities to simplify the design as it progresses; civic presence of the proposed building and opportunities to further define the main entry; site constraints, topography and vegetation; locations of proposed parking areas and access; and, community outreach strategies, including virtual polling.

MSBA staff reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study and all other subsequent submittals with the District and found:

- 1) The options investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in scope, the approach undertaken in this study was appropriate, and the District’s Preferred Schematic is reasonable, cost-effective, and meets the needs identified by the District.
- 2) Prior to the submission of the District’s Schematic Design submittal, the MSBA requests that the District be available to present updates associated with the Preferred Schematic to

the FAS should the MSBA determine that a District presentation is required. This update is to ensure a mutual understanding and agreement of the proposed project scope and to ensure that this scope will be reflected in the District's Schematic Design submittal.

- 3) The District has submitted an operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget statement for MSBA review.
- 4) The District's Special Education submission will be subject to final review and approval by the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education as part of the Schematic Design submittal, which is prior to executing a Project Scope and Budget Agreement.
- 5) Subject to Board approval, the MSBA will participate in a project that includes spaces that meet MSBA guidelines, except for variations previously agreed to by the MSBA. All proposed spaces will be reviewed during the Schematic Design phase.
- 6) As part of the Schematic Design phase, the District will work with the MSBA to determine a mutually agreeable methodology to differentiate eligible costs from ineligible costs.

Based on the review outlined above, staff recommend that the Town of Canton be approved to proceed into Schematic Design to replace the existing William H. Galvin Middle School with a new facility serving grades 5-8 on the site of the existing school.