

District: Whitman-Hanson Regional School District
 School Name: Whitman Middle School
 Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic
 Date: April 19, 2023

Recommendation

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the Whitman-Hanson Regional School District (the “District”), as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to proceed into Schematic Design to replace the existing Whitman Middle School with a new facility serving grades 5-8 on the site of the existing Whitman Middle School. MSBA staff has reviewed the Feasibility Study and accepts the District’s Preferred Schematic.

District Information	
District Name	Whitman-Hanson Regional School District
Elementary School(s)	The Pre-School at Whitman-Hanson Regional High School (PK) Indian Head Elementary School (K-4) John H. Duval Elementary School (K-4) Louise A. Conley Elementary School (K-5)
Middle School(s)	Hanson Middle School (5-8) Whitman Middle School (6-8)
High School(s)	Whitman-Hanson Regional High School (9-12)
Priority School Name	Whitman Middle School
Type of School	Middle School
Grades Served	6-8
Year Opened	1972
Existing Square Footage	105,004
Additions	Major renovation completed in 2000
Acreage of Site	26.42 acres
Building Issues	The District identified deficiencies in the following areas: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Structural integrity - Mechanical systems - Electrical systems - Plumbing systems - Envelope - Windows - Roof - Accessibility In addition to the physical plant issues, the District reported that the existing facility does not support the delivery of its educational program.
Original Design Capacity	Unknown
2022-2023 Enrollment	504
Agreed Upon Enrollment	Study Enrollment includes the following configurations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 515 students in grades 6-8 (Current Configuration) - 675 students in grades 5-8 (Preferred Schematic)

District Information	
Enrollment Specifics	Contingent upon the Board’s approval of the Preferred Schematic, the District will sign a Design Enrollment Certification for 675 students in grades 5-8.
Total Project Budget – Debt Exclusion Anticipated	Yes

MSBA Board Votes	
Invitation to Eligibility Period	December 11, 2019
Invitation to Feasibility Study	April 14, 2021
Preferred Schematic Authorization	On April 26, 2023 Board agenda
Project Scope & Budget Authorization	District is targeting Board authorization on October 25, 2023
Feasibility Study Reimbursement Rate (Incentive points are not applicable)	69.76%

Consultants	
Owner’s Project Manager (the “OPM”)	Colliers Project Leaders USA NE, LLC
Designer	Ai3 Architects, LLC

Discussion

The existing Whitman Middle School is a 105,004 square-foot facility located on a 26.42-acre site currently serving students in grades 6-8. The original school building was constructed in 1972, with a single-story addition to house the administration department constructed in 2000.

The District’s Statement of Interest (“SOI”) identified numerous deficiencies in the existing facility associated with the following: outdated mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems; building envelope; accessibility issues; and existing spaces not conducive for delivering the District’s educational program.

As part of the Feasibility Study, the MSBA accepted the District’s request to explore options that included relocating grade 5 students into the middle school resulting in the following study design enrollments: 515 students in grades 6-8; and 675 students in grades 5-8.

In conjunction with its consultants, the District performed a comprehensive assessment of the existing conditions and the educational program and received input from educators, administrators, and facilities personnel. Based on the findings of this effort, the District and its consultants initially studied (11) preliminary options that included: (1) code upgrade/base repair option, (4) addition/renovation options, and (6) new construction options, as presented below.

Option	Description of Preliminary Options
Option 1	Code Upgrade/Base Repair only for grades 6-8 with an enrollment of 515 students at the existing Whitman Middle School; with an estimated construction duration of +/- 36 months; and an estimated total project cost of \$56.75 million.

Option 2a	Addition/Renovation for grades 6-8 with an enrollment of 515 students at the existing Whitman Middle School (2-story building; no auditorium); with an estimated construction duration of +/- 42 months; and an estimated total project cost of \$109.9 million.
Option 3a	Addition/Renovation for grades 6-8 with an enrollment of 515 students at the Whitman Middle School (2-story building; with an auditorium); with an estimated construction duration of +/- 44 months; and an estimated total project cost of \$117.6 million.
Option 4a	New Construction for grades 6-8 with an enrollment of 515 students at the Whitman Middle School site (2-story building; no auditorium); with an estimated construction duration of +/- 28 months; and an estimated total project cost of \$96.4 million.
Option 5a	New Construction for grades 6-8 with an enrollment of 515 students at the Whitman Middle School site (2-story building; with an auditorium); with an estimated construction duration of +/- 28 months; and an estimated total project cost of \$100.9 million.
Option 5b	New Construction for grades 6-8 with an enrollment of 515 students at the Whitman Middle School site (3-story building; with an auditorium); with an estimated construction duration of +/- 28 months; and an estimated total project cost of \$96.9 million.
Option 6a	Addition/Renovation for grades 5-8 with an enrollment of 675 students at the Whitman Middle School (2-story building; no auditorium); with an estimated construction duration of +/- 46 months; and an estimated total project cost of \$121.5 million.
Option 7a	Addition/Renovation for grades 5-8 with an enrollment of 675 students at the Whitman Middle School (2-story building; with an auditorium); with an estimated construction duration of +/- 48 months; and an estimated total project cost of \$129.3 million.
Option 8a	New Construction for grades 5-8 with an enrollment of 675 students at the Whitman Middle School site (2-story building; no auditorium); with an estimated construction duration of +/- 32 months; and an estimated total project cost of \$108.9 million.
Option 9a	New Construction for grades 5-8 with an enrollment of 675 students at the Whitman Middle School site (2-story building; with an auditorium); with an estimated construction duration of +/- 32 months; and an estimated total project cost of \$113.8 million.
Option 9b	New Construction for grades 5-8 with an enrollment of 675 students at the Whitman Middle School site (3-story building; with an auditorium); with an estimated construction duration of +/- 32 months; and an estimated total project cost of \$109.3 million.

As a result of this analysis, the District determined that “Option 1” is not considered a viable option because it does not meet the needs of the District’s educational program, does not provide new instructional technology, needed programs, expanded community resources, or many of the educational and community benefits inherent in a viable solution. However, this option was included for cost comparison purposes.

The District determined “Options 2a and 6a” would not be considered for further evaluation because the 2-story addition/renovation designs do not provide the District’s preferred adjacencies, requires phased construction resulting in a longer construction duration, and the occupied renovations require temporary modular classrooms and would result in significant disruption to ongoing education during construction.

The District determined “Options 5a and 9a” would not be considered for further evaluation because the 2-story new construction designs resulted in larger building footprints and were more costly than the 3-story building design options.

Subsequent to the evaluation of preliminary options, the District further developed the 2-story building designs of “Options 4a and 8a” which are now 3-story building designs referred to as “Options 4b and 8b”.

MSBA staff and the District agreed to explore the following (7) options for further development and consideration in the final evaluation and development of preliminary design pricing as presented below, including: (1) code upgrade/base repair option, (2) renovation/renovation options, and (4) new construction options. Please note “Option 1” was considered for further evaluation by the District; however, this option was included for cost comparison purposes only.

Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing for Final Evaluation of Options

Option (Description)	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sq. ft.)	Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sq. ft.)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sq. ft.)	Estimated Total Project Costs
Option 1: Base Repair/Code Upgrade	105,004	105,004 \$87/sq. ft.	N/A	\$36,317,306	\$45,432,703 \$433/sq. ft.	\$56,790,895
Option 3a: Addition/Renovation for grades 6-8 (2-story)	129,308	84,285 \$649/sq. ft.	45,023 \$687/sq. ft.	\$10,666,248	\$96,289,254 \$745/sq. ft.	\$120,361,280
Option 7a: Addition/Renovation for grades 5-8 (2-story)	147,049	84,285 \$625/sq. ft.	62,764 \$672/sq. ft.	\$10,666,248	\$105,528,488 \$718/sq. ft.	\$131,910,591
Option 4b: New Construction for grades 6-8 (3-story)	110,095	N/A	110,095 \$685/sq. ft.	\$11,831,611	\$87,255,620 \$793/sq. ft.	\$109,069,525
Option 5b: New Construction for grades 6-8 (3-story)	114,956	N/A	114,956 \$686/sq. ft.	\$11,831,611	\$90,727,088 \$789/sq. ft.	\$113,408,860
Option 8b: New Construction for grades 5-8 (3-story)	130,687	N/A	130,687 \$661/sq. ft.	\$11,831,611	\$98,151,876 \$751/sq. ft.	\$122,689,845

Option (Description)	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sq. ft.)	Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sq. ft.)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sq. ft.)	Estimated Total Project Costs
<i>Option 9b: New Construction for grades 5-8 (3-story)***</i>	139,495	N/A	139,495 \$657/sq. ft.	\$11,831,611	\$103,445,108 \$742/sq. ft.	\$129,306,385

* Marked up construction costs

** Does not include construction contingency

****District's Preferred Schematic*

The District has selected “Option 9b” as the Preferred Schematic to proceed into Schematic Design as the District determined that this option best meets the needs of the District’s educational program. This option also results in a compact building footprint (3-story building), by locating the auditorium on the second floor and by stacking the 8th grade wing above the gymnasium that reduces the overall building footprint.

As noted above, “Option 1” was not considered a viable option but was included for cost comparison purposes only.

“Options 3a and 7a” were not selected by the District because the proposed addition/renovation options would require phased construction resulting in a longer construction duration, the occupied renovations require temporary modular classrooms and would result in significant disruption to ongoing education during construction. Although the District indicated these options improve the existing building organization by creating grade level academic neighborhoods, not all adjacencies are ideal given the constraints of the existing building.

Although “Options 4b and 5b” would support delivery of the District’s educational program for grades 6-8, these options were not selected by the District because these options do not align with the District’s preferred grade configuration.

Although “Option 8b” aligns with the District’s preferred grade configuration, this option was not selected by the District because this option does not include an auditorium.

The District presented its proposed Preferred Schematic to the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee (“FAS”) on March 15, 2023. At that meeting, members of the FAS discussed the following items: appreciation of the Educational Program; plans for professional development for 5th and 6th grade teachers as it relates to the proposed changes to grade configuration; further development of the proposed two main entrances and use of a common entrance plaza; consideration of hierarchy for approach to the site and clear identification of entrance to the building; opportunities to refine site circulation and appreciation of island buffer for bus parking; State Seal of Biliteracy and world language program opportunities for English Language Learner students; considerations associated with distribution of grade levels per floor; relationship of the covered outdoor classroom to the science room; distribution of Special Education program spaces and DESE submittal process; cost considerations associated with the proposed Auditorium and communication from the District to inform its residents of related costs; the proposed curved

academic wings and opportunities to consider segmentation to simplify design for constructability; and, status of Lease language.

MSBA staff reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study and all other subsequent submittals with the District and found:

- 1) The options investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in scope, the approach undertaken in this study was appropriate, and the District's Preferred Schematic is reasonable and cost-effective and meets the needs identified by the District.
- 2) The District has submitted an operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget statement for MSBA review.
- 3) The District's Special Education submission will be subject to final review and approval by the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education as part of the Schematic Design submittal, which is prior to executing a Project Scope and Budget Agreement.
- 4) Subject to Board approval, the MSBA will participate in a project that includes spaces that meet MSBA guidelines, except for variations previously agreed to by the MSBA. All proposed spaces will be reviewed during the Schematic Design phase.
- 5) As part of the Schematic Design phase, the District will work with the MSBA to determine a mutually agreeable methodology to differentiate eligible costs from ineligible costs.

Based on the review outlined above, staff recommends that the Whitman-Hanson Regional School District be approved to proceed into Schematic Design to replace the existing Whitman Middle School with a new facility serving grades 5-8 on the site of the existing Whitman Middle School.