

District: Town of Dedham  
 School Name: Oakdale Elementary School  
 Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic  
 Date: October 18, 2023

**Recommendation**

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the Town of Dedham (the “District”), as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to proceed into Schematic Design to replace the existing Oakdale Elementary School and Greenlodge Elementary School with a new facility serving students in grades 1-5 on the existing Oakdale Elementary school site. MSBA staff has reviewed the Feasibility Study and accepts the District’s Preferred Schematic.

<b>District Information</b>	
District Name	Town of Dedham
Elementary School(s)	Dedham Early Childhood Center (PK-K) Avery Elementary School (1-5) Greenlodge Elementary School (1-5) Oakdale Elementary School (1-5) Riverdale Elementary School (1-5)
Middle School(s)	Dedham Middle School (6-8)
High School(s)	Dedham High School (9-12)
Priority School Name	Oakdale Elementary School
Type of School	Elementary School
Grades Served	1-5
Year Opened	1902
Existing Square Footage	53,524
Additions	1951 – Addition 1970 – Addition of 2 modular classrooms
Acreage of Site	6.9-acres
Building Issues	The District identified deficiencies in the following areas: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Mechanical systems</li> <li>• Electrical systems</li> <li>• Plumbing systems</li> <li>• Building Envelope</li> <li>• Windows</li> <li>• Roof</li> <li>• Accessibility</li> </ul> In addition to the physical plant issues, the District reported that the existing facility does not support the delivery of its educational program.
Original Design Capacity	Unknown
2022-2023 Enrollment	245 students
Agreed Upon Enrollment	Study Enrollment includes the following configurations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 235 students in grades 1-5 at the existing Oakdale Elementary School.</li> </ul>

<b>District Information</b>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 450 students in grades 1-5, consolidating the existing Oakdale Elementary School and Riverdale Elementary School.</li> <li>• <b><i>550 students in grades 1-5, consolidating the existing Oakdale Elementary School and Greenlodge Elementary School. (Preferred Schematic)</i></b></li> </ul>
Enrollment Specifics	Contingent upon the Board’s approval of the Preferred Schematic, the District will sign a Design Enrollment Certification for 550 students in grades 1-5.
Total Project Budget – Debt Exclusion Anticipated	Yes

<b>MSBA Board Votes</b>	
Invitation to Eligibility Period	April 14, 2021
Invitation to Feasibility Study	March 2, 2022
Preferred Schematic Authorization	On October 25, 2023 Board agenda
Project Scope & Budget Authorization	District is targeting Board authorization on February 28, 2024
Feasibility Study Reimbursement Rate (Incentive points are not applicable)	47.21%

<b>Consultants</b>	
Owner’s Project Manager (the “OPM”)	The Vertex Companies, LLC
Designer	Jonathan Levi Architects LLC

## Discussion

As part of the Feasibility Study, the MSBA accepted the District’s request to explore the following three study enrollment options students in grades 1-5:

- Enrollment 1: 235 students in grades 1-5 at the existing Oakdale Elementary School.
- Enrollment 2: 450 students in grades 1-5, consolidating the existing Oakdale Elementary School and Riverdale Elementary School.
- Enrollment 3: 550 students in grades 1-5, consolidating the existing Oakdale Elementary School and Greenlodge Elementary School.

The existing Oakdale Elementary School is a 53,524 square foot facility located on a 6.9-acre site that currently serves students in grades 1-5. The original school building was constructed in 1902, with an addition in 1951, and the addition of 2 modular classrooms in 1970.

The District’s Statement of Interest (SOI) identified numerous deficiencies in the existing Oakdale Elementary School facility associated with the following: outdated mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems; building envelope; accessibility issues; and the District reported that the existing facility does not support the delivery of its educational program.

As noted above, the District’s Feasibility Study included three study enrollment options. One of those options considered potential consolidation of the existing Oakdale Elementary School with the existing Riverdale Elementary School. The existing Riverdale Elementary School is a 40,500 square foot facility, located on a 3.1-acre site that currently serves students in grades 1-5. The original school building was constructed in 1920, with an auditorium addition in 1930 and a gym and classroom wing addition in 1952.

Additionally, another enrollment option considered potential consolidation of the existing Oakdale Elementary School with the existing Greenlodge Elementary School. The existing Greenlodge Elementary School is a 40,273 square foot facility, located on a 15.8-acre site that currently serves students in grades 1-5. The original school building was constructed in 1955, with an addition in 1961, and the addition of 2 modular classrooms in 1970.

In conjunction with its consultants, the District performed a comprehensive assessment of the existing conditions of the three facilities and the educational program and received input from educators, administrators, and facilities personnel. Based on the findings of this effort, the District and its consultants initially studied (16) preliminary options that included (7) addition/renovation options and (9) new construction options. The following is a detailed list of the preliminary options considered.

<b>Option</b>	<b>Description of Preliminary Options</b>
Option 1	Addition/Renovation for grades 1-5 with an enrollment of 235 students at the existing Oakdale Elementary School; with an estimated total project cost of \$69.4 million.
Option 2	Addition/Renovation for grades 1-5 with an enrollment of 450 students at the existing Oakdale Elementary School; with an estimated total project cost of \$90.2 million.
Option 3	Addition/Renovation for grades 1-5 with an enrollment of 550 students at the existing Oakdale Elementary School; with an estimated total project cost of \$103.2 million.
Option 4	New Construction for grades 1-5 with an enrollment of 235 students at the existing Oakdale Elementary School site; with an estimated total project cost of \$61.6 million.
Option 5	New Construction for grades 1-5 with an enrollment of 450 students at the existing Oakdale Elementary School site; with an estimated total project cost of \$81.9 million.
Option 6	New Construction for grades 1-5 with an enrollment of 550 students at the existing Oakdale Elementary School site; with an estimated total project cost of \$94.7 million.
Option 7	Addition/Renovation for grades 1-5 with an enrollment of 550 students at the Greenlodge Elementary School site; with an estimated total project cost of \$109.4 million.
Option 8	New Construction for grades 1-5 with an enrollment of 550 students at the Greenlodge Elementary School site; with an estimated total project cost of \$97.7 million.
Option 9	Addition/Renovation for grades 1-5 with an enrollment of 450 students at the Riverdale Elementary School; with an estimated total project cost of \$91.3 million.

Option 10	New Construction for grades 1-5 with an enrollment of 450 students at the Riverdale Elementary School site; with an estimated total project cost of \$81.4 million.
Option 11	Addition/Renovation for grades 1-5 with an enrollment of 235 students at the Capen School; with an estimated total project cost of \$69.1 million.
Option 12	Addition/Renovation for grades 1-5 with an enrollment of 550 students at the Capen School site; with an estimated total project cost of \$103.5 million.
Option 13	New Construction for grades 1-5 with an enrollment of 235 students at the Capen School site; with an estimated total project cost of \$62.8 million.
Option 14	New Construction for grades 1-5 with an enrollment of 550 students at the Capen School site; with an estimated total project cost of \$97.3 million.
Option 15	New Construction for grades 1-5 with an enrollment of 235 students at the Striar site; with an estimated total project cost of \$63.1 million.
Option 16	New Construction for grades 1-5 with an enrollment of 550 students at the Striar site; with an estimated total project cost of \$98.4 million.

Subsequent to the evaluation of preliminary options, the District voted to select the 550-student option as its desired enrollment option, which proposes to consolidate the Oakdale and the Greenlodge Elementary Schools. The following describes the outcome of this decision relative to other study enrollment options as well various site selection scenarios:

- The District determined that “Options 15 and 16” would not be considered for further evaluation because the District eliminated the Striar site due to safety concerns associated with restricted access to the site, wetland restrictions, and because this site is not controlled by the District.
- Based on the District’s decision to move forward with a 550-student enrollment option, the 235-student enrollment options associated with “Options 11 and 13” were eliminated from further consideration. However, “Options 1 and 4” were included as part of the final evaluation for comparative purposes.
- The District’s decision to move forward with the 550-student enrollment resulted in the District eliminating the 450-student enrollment options associated with the Riverdale Elementary School (“Options 9 and 10”) for further consideration. However, , “Options 2 and 5” were included as part of the final evaluation for comparative purposes.
- The District determined that “Options 7 and 8” would not be considered for further evaluation because the District eliminated the Greenlodge Elementary School site because of the sloped nature of the site, existing wetlands constraints, and extensive ledge which make the Greenlodge Elementary School site challenging to building on with limited usable space.
- Based on the District’s preference to select the existing Oakdale Elementary School site as the location of the proposed project, “Options 12 and 14” were eliminated from further consideration due to traffic concerns and a steep topography.

Following the evaluation of preliminary options, the District developed the (3) code upgrade options for the existing schools included as part of the feasibility study, for cost comparison purposes. These options are referred to as the following:

- “Option 1A”: Code upgrade at the existing Oakdale Elementary School
- “Option 1A.2”: Code upgrade at the existing Riverdale Elementary School; and,
- “Option 1A.3”: Code upgrade at the existing Greenlodge Elementary School.

Additionally, and subsequent to the evaluation of preliminary options, the District renamed the following options:

- “Option 1”: Addition/renovation for 235 students at the existing Oakdale Elementary School, was renamed and referred to as “Option 1B.3”.
- “Option 2”: Addition/renovation option for 450 students at the existing Oakdale Elementary School, was renamed and referred to as “Option 1B.2”.
- “Option 3”: Addition/renovation for 550 students at the existing Oakdale Elementary School, was renamed and referred to as “Option 1.B” (also referred to as “Option C”).
- “Option 4”: New construction for 235 students at the existing Oakdale Elementary School site, was renamed and referred to as “Option 5C”.
- “Option 5”: New construction for 450 students at the existing Oakdale Elementary School site, was renamed and referred to as “Option 5B”.
- “Option 6”: New construction for 550 students at the existing Oakdale Elementary School, was renamed and further developed into the following three options:
  - “Option 3” (also referred to as “Option A” the Academic Courtyard Concept)
  - “Option 4” (also referred to as "Option B” the Common Core Welcome Concept)
  - “Option 5" (also referred to as “Option D” the Core Cluster Concept)

Upon further review, MSBA staff and the District agreed to (11) final options for further development and consideration in the final evaluation and development of preliminary design pricing as presented below.

**Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing for Final Evaluation of Options**

<b>Option (Description)</b>	<b>Total Gross Square Feet</b>	<b>Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sq. ft.)</b>	<b>Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sq. ft.)</b>	<b>Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*</b>	<b>Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sq. ft.)</b>	<b>Estimated Total Project Costs</b>
<b>Option 1A</b> (Code Upgrade at the Oakdale Elementary School)	53,524	53,524 \$644/sq. ft.	N/A	\$4,872,861	\$39,357,197 \$735/sq. ft.	\$51,164,356
<b>Option 1A.2</b> (Code Upgrade at the Riverdale Elementary School)	40,500	40,500 \$671/sq. ft.	N/A	\$4,537,057	\$31,696,357 \$783/sq. ft.	\$41,205,264
<b>Option 1A.3</b> (Code upgrade at the Greenlodge Elementary School)	38,950	38,950 \$683/sq. ft.	N/A	\$4,334,757	\$30,948,124 \$795/sq. ft.	\$40,232,561

<b>Option (Description)</b>	<b>Total Gross Square Feet</b>	<b>Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sq. ft.)</b>	<b>Square Feet of New Constructio n (cost*/sq. ft.)</b>	<b>Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*</b>	<b>Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sq. ft.)</b>	<b>Estimated Total Project Costs</b>
<b>Option 1B</b> (Addition/ Renovation at the Oakdale Elementary School for 550 students)	107,000	79,544 \$804/sq. ft.	27,456 \$686/sq. ft.	\$10,678,945	\$93,428,956 \$873/sq. ft.	\$121,457,643
<b>Option 1B.2</b> (Addition/ Renovation at the Oakdale Elementary School for 450 students)	72,000	27,456 \$693/sq. ft.	44,544 \$872/sq. ft.	\$10,580,483	\$68,421,992 \$950/sq. ft.	\$88,948,590
<b>Option 1B.3</b> (Addition/ Renovation at the Oakdale Elementary School for 235 students)	50,000	27,456 \$697/sq. ft.	22,544 \$956/sq. ft.	\$9,867,401	\$50,580,248 \$1,012/sq. ft.	\$65,754,323
<b>Option 3</b> (New construction at the existing Oakdale Elementary School site for 550 students)	103,000	N/A	103,000 \$759/sq. ft.	\$9,244,092	\$87,391,222 \$848/sq. ft.	\$113,608,589
<b>Option 4</b> (New construction at the existing Oakdale Elementary School site for 550 students)	103,000	N/A	103,000 \$760/sq. ft.	\$9,217,276	\$87,511,696 \$850/sq. ft.	\$113,765,205
<b>Option 5***</b> ( <i>New Construction at the existing Oakdale Elementary School site for 550 students</i> )	<b>103,000</b>	<b>N/A</b>	<b>103,000</b> <b>\$758/sq. ft.</b>	<b>\$9,042,427</b>	<b>\$87,069,047</b> <b>\$845/sq. ft.</b>	<b>\$113,189,761</b>
<b>Option 5B</b> (New construction at the existing Oakdale Elementary School site for 450 students)	72,000	N/A	72,000 \$742/sq. ft.	\$9,867,401	\$63,296,441 \$879/sq. ft.	\$82,285,374
<b>Option 5C</b> (New construction at the existing Oakdale Elementary School	50,000	N/A	50,000 \$854/sq. ft.	\$9,867,401	\$52,140,620 \$1,043/sq. ft.	\$67,782,806

Option (Description)	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sq. ft.)	Square Feet of New Constructio n (cost*/sq. ft.)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sq. ft.)	Estimated Total Project Costs
site for 235 students)						

\* Marked up construction costs

\*\* Does not include construction contingency

\*\*\*District’s Preferred Schematic

The District has selected “Option 5” as the Preferred Schematic to proceed into Schematic Design as the District determined that this option best meets the needs of the District’s educational program and aligns with the District’s decision to move forward with a 550-student enrollment. Additionally, the site is relatively flat, owned by the District, with large open areas for construction, which is anticipated to minimize disruption to ongoing education during construction. Further, the District determined that this option maximizes green space, consists of adequate space for site access and circulation, and does not involve any existing wetlands or flood restrictions.

“Options 1A, 1A.2, and 1A.3” were not selected by the District because these options would not meet the needs of the District’s educational program and would significantly disrupt the students during construction as a result of being relocated to temporary modular swing space. Please note these options were included as part of the final evaluation for cost comparison purposes only.

“Option 1B” was not selected by the District because it would result in complex phasing to avoid the need for swing space and result in significant disruption to ongoing education during construction.

“Options 1B.2 and 1B.3” were not selected by the District because they would result in significant disruption to ongoing education during construction and these options do not satisfy the District’s desired enrollment of 550-students. Please note these options were included for cost comparison purposes only.

Although “Option 3” meets the needs of the District’s educational program, this option was not selected by the District as the curved “Core Cluster” building design concept was favored over the “Academic Courtyard” building design concept as this option offers a less desirable separation from the abutters.

Although “Option 4” meets the needs of the District’s educational program, this option was not selected by the District because the proposed location of a centrally located gymnasium was considered unfavorable by the District.

“Options 5B and 5C” were not selected by the District because these options do not satisfy the District’s desired enrollment of 550-students.

The District presented its proposed Preferred Schematic to the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee (“FAS”) on September 20, 2023. At that meeting, members of the FAS discussed the following items: appreciation of the updates to the Educational Program and responses to

comments; the importance of professional development as it relates to the proposed changes to teaching methodology, particularly as it relates to project based learning; sheltered access to the building for individuals with limited mobility; opportunities to develop indoor/outdoor connections; ongoing traffic study and further development of the proposed site plan; site circulation and the proposed safety access lane; location of the gym and the proposed parking areas; the existing 1902 facility; clarification of the massing of the proposed building; and, opportunities to simplify the design for constructability and management of construction costs.

MSBA staff reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study and all other subsequent submittals with the District and found:

- 1) The options investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in scope, the approach undertaken in this study was appropriate, and the District's Preferred Schematic is reasonable and cost-effective and meets the needs identified by the District.
- 2) Prior to the submission of the District's Schematic Design submittal, the MSBA requests that the District be available to present updates to the preferred solution to the FAS should the MSBA determine an updated presentation is required. This update is to ensure a mutual understanding and agreement of the proposed project scope and to ensure that this scope will be reflected in the District's Schematic Design submittal.
- 3) The District has submitted an operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget statement for MSBA review.
- 4) The District's Special Education submission will be subject to final review and approval by the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education as part of the Schematic Design submittal, which is prior to executing a Project Scope and Budget Agreement.
- 5) Subject to Board approval, the MSBA will participate in a project that includes spaces that meet MSBA guidelines, except for variations previously agreed to by the MSBA. All proposed spaces will be reviewed during the Schematic Design phase.
- 6) As part of the Schematic Design phase, the District will work with the MSBA to determine a mutually agreeable methodology to differentiate eligible costs from ineligible costs.

Based on the review outlined above, staff recommends that the Town of Dedham be approved to proceed into Schematic Design to replace the existing Oakdale Elementary School and Greenlodge Elementary School with a new facility serving students in grades 1-5 on the existing Oakdale Elementary school site.