

District: City of Gloucester
 School Name: East Gloucester Elementary School
 Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic
 Date: December 4, 2019

Recommendation

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the City of Gloucester (the “District”), as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to proceed into Schematic Design to replace the existing East Gloucester Elementary School and Veterans Memorial School with a new combined facility serving grades K-5 on the existing Veterans Memorial School site, contingent upon the District gaining full ownership, control, and exclusive use of the site. MSBA staff has reviewed the Feasibility Study and accepts the District’s Preferred Schematic.

District Information	
District Name	City of Gloucester
Elementary School(s)	Gloucester Pre-School (PK) Beeman Memorial Elementary School (K-5) East Gloucester Elementary School (K-5) Plum Cove Elementary School (K-5) Veterans Memorial School (K-5) West Parish Elementary School (K-5)
Middle School(s)	O'Maley Innovation Middle School (6-8)
High School(s)	Gloucester High School (9-12)
Priority School Name	East Gloucester Elementary School
Type of School	Elementary School
Grades Served	K-5
Year Opened	1948
Existing Square Footage	31,077
Additions	1989 – Addition of five (5) classrooms 2005 – Addition of modular Units
Acreage of Site	2.82 acres
Building Issues	The District identified deficiencies in the following areas: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Mechanical systems – Electrical systems – Plumbing systems In addition to the physical plant issues, the District reported that the existing facility does not support the delivery of its educational program.
Original Design Capacity	Unknown
2018-2019 Enrollment	209
Agreed Upon Enrollment	Study Enrollment includes the following configurations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – 230 Students: East Gloucester Elementary School – 440 Students: consolidated East Gloucester Elementary and Veterans Memorial Schools (Preferred Solution)

District Information	
Enrollment Specifics	Contingent upon the Board’s approval of the Preferred Schematic, the District will sign a Design Enrollment Certification for 440 students in grades K-5
Total Project Budget – Debt Exclusion Anticipated	Yes

MSBA Board Votes	
Invitation to Eligibility Period	February 15, 2017
Invitation to Feasibility Study	February 14, 2018
Preferred Schematic Authorization	On December 11, 2019 Board agenda
Project Scope & Budget Authorization	District is targeting Board authorization on June 24, 2020
Feasibility Study Reimbursement Rate (Incentive points are not applicable)	61.02%

Consultants	
Owner’s Project Manager (the “OPM”)	CBRE/Heery, Inc.
Designer	Dore & Whittier Architects, Inc.

Discussion

The existing East Gloucester Elementary School is a 31,077 square-foot facility located on 2.82 acres in a densely built residential neighborhood in the City of Gloucester. The original school building was constructed in 1948 and was added to in 1989 and 2005. The facility currently houses grades K-5.

The District identified numerous deficiencies in the Statement of Interest including mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems past their useful life. Additionally, the District has expressed concerns about insufficient space for Special Education programming, and about the size and layout of the existing facility impeding the delivery of the District’s educational program.

The District requested, and the MSBA agreed to study potential solutions that include consolidation of East Gloucester Elementary School with Veterans Memorial School.

Constructed in 1956, Veterans Memorial School is a 34,700 square foot facility located on a 5.47-acre parcel bounded by Webster Street, Eastern Avenue, and Yankee Division Highway. The facility currently houses grades K-5.

The District has expressed concerns about the condition of the roof, indoor air quality, the presence of mold resulting from years of roof leaks, and the condition of the existing facility’s electrical system.

Together with its consultants, the District performed a comprehensive assessment of the existing conditions and the educational program, and received input from educators, administrators, and facilities personnel. Based on the findings of that effort, the District and its consultants initially studied fourteen (14) preliminary options that included four (4) addition/renovation

configurations and eight (8) new construction options. The following is a list of the preliminary options considered, which includes options for each of the District’s two (2) study enrollments: 230 students (grades K-5) and 440 students (grades K-5).

List of Options from the Preliminary Evaluation of Options

Option Name	Option Description	Enrollment Option	Site
A1	Capital Improvements & Code Upgrade	230 students	East Gloucester Elementary School (“EGES”)
A2	Renovation only	230 students	EGES
B1	Addition/Renovation	230 students	EGES
B2	Addition/Renovation	230 students	EGES
B3	Addition/Renovation	440 students	EGES
C1	Addition/Renovation	440 students	EGES
D1	New Construction	230 students	EGES
E1	New Construction	440 students	EGES
E2	New Construction	440 students	EGES
E3	New Construction	440 students	EGES
F1	New Construction	440 students	Veterans Memorial School (“VMS”)
F2	New Construction	440 students	VMS
G1	New Construction	440 students	Green St/School House Rd (“GSSHR”)
G2	New Construction	440 students	GSSHR

After further review, MSBA staff and the District agreed to nine (9) final options for further development and consideration in the final evaluation. Preliminary design pricing for each of the nine (9) options is presented below.

Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing for the Final Evaluation of Options

Option Name & Description	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sf)	Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sq. ft.)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sq. ft.)	Estimated Total Project Costs
Option A1: <i>Capital Improvements & Code Upgrade at EGES site (230 students)</i>	31,077	31,077 \$249/sf	-	\$1,170,041	\$8,907,605 \$287/sf	\$15,832,000
Option A2: <i>Renovation only at EGES site (230 students)</i>	31,077	31,077 \$454/sf	-	\$8,057,605	\$19,863,033 \$639/sf	\$27,800,000
Option B1: <i>Addition/Renovation at EGES site (230 students)</i>	65,375	9,911 \$436/sf	55,464 \$558/sf	\$7,446,585	\$42,721,785 \$653/sf	\$57,400,000
Option C1: <i>Addition/Renovation at EGES site (440 students)</i>	99,967	9,966 \$428/sf	90,001 \$525/sf	\$7,488,327	\$58,984,790 \$590/sf	\$81,200,000

Option Name & Description	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sf)	Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sq. ft.)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sq. ft.)	Estimated Total Project Costs
Option D1: <i>New Construction at EGES site (230 students)</i>	59,130	-	59,130 \$521/sf	\$6,891,391	\$37,719,409 \$638/sf	\$52,400,000
Option E2: <i>New Construction at EGES site (440 students)</i>	89,036	-	89,036 \$499/sf	\$8,333,377	\$52,797,741 \$593/sf	\$72,900,000
Option F2: <i>New Construction at VMS site (440 students) ***</i>	89,036	-	89,036 \$506sf	\$9,527,057	\$54,537,175 \$613/sf	\$72,804,000
Option G1: <i>New Construction at Green St/School House Rd site (440 students)</i>	89,036	-	89,036 \$506/sf	\$6,968,745	\$52,029,976 \$584/sf	\$68,573,000
Option G2: <i>New Construction at Green St/School House Rd site (440 students)</i>	89,036	-	89,036 \$506sf	\$7,592,844	\$52,654,076 \$591/sf	\$69,375,000

* *Marked up construction costs*

** *Does not include construction contingency*

*** ***District's Preferred Schematic***

The District has selected “Option F2” as the Preferred Schematic to proceed into Schematic Design because it best supports the goals outlined in the District’s Educational Program. Additionally, “Option F2” received the highest score when the options under consideration were ranked against the following evaluation criteria developed by the School Building Committee: (1) ability of the Preferred Schematic to fulfill the goals of the District’s master plan including consolidation of school facilities; (2) walkability and student transportation; (3) size of site to accommodate parking, student drop-off, and other outdoor spaces; (4) impact of traffic on the neighborhood; (5) impact on open space in the District; (6) environmental impact on the site; and (7) permitting, easements, and utility access.

“Option A1,” “A2,” “B1,” and “D1” were eliminated from further consideration because they did not allow the District to meet its goal of consolidating school facilities.

“Option C1” and “E2” were eliminated from further consideration by the District because it was determined that locating a facility for 440 students on the East Gloucester Elementary School site would increase, rather than reduce, existing traffic concerns including: insufficient parking; insufficient bus turnaround space; and insufficient street space to permit school buses, passenger cars, delivery vehicles, and service vehicles from accessing the site at the same time. These options were also eliminated because the District determined that the East Gloucester Elementary

School site is further from the desired combined catchment area for the proposed project than either the Veterans Memorial School or the Green Street/School House Road sites.

“Option G1” and “G2” were eliminated from further consideration because the District determined the following: the Green Street/School House Road site is less walkable than the Veterans Memorial School site; it would require use and utility easements; and it would result in greater environmental impact and degradation than the proposed project site (the Veterans Memorial School site is “pre-disturbed” while a large portion of the proposed Green Street/School House Road site is undeveloped).

The District presented its proposed Preferred Schematic to the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee (“FAS”) on November 20, 2019. At that meeting, members of the FAS expressed their appreciation for the following: the District’s educational program; the District’s approach to site selection; and the proposed floorplan, specifically, the distribution of special education spaces. Also, FAS members offered the following observations for review by the District and its design team: consider the relationship between the extended and outdoor learning areas; consider providing professional development to support the proposed merging of teaching methodologies in the new facility; consider performing noise and air quality testing; consider drainage and resiliency for both site and building; consider providing storage solutions and display areas within classrooms; consider providing air conditioning throughout the facility; ensure that the floorplan provides sufficient toilet facilities in the public zones of the new facility; consider selecting furnishings and finishes made with non-toxic materials; and consider collaborative purchasing for furnishings and technology. Finally, the following topics were discussed at the FAS meeting: internet accessibility; the District’s gardening program; safety and security; staffing of the proposed Library/Media Center; and project cost.

MSBA staff notes that the proposed project includes the demolition of two schools, the existing East Gloucester Elementary School and the existing Veterans Memorial School. In the case of the East Gloucester site, the District intends to create space for a park. In the case of the Veterans Memorial site, the District will use the space for parking and access roads to support the new facility.

MSBA staff reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study and all other subsequent submittals with the District and found:

- 1) The options investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in scope, the approach undertaken in this study was appropriate, and the District’s Preferred Schematic meets the needs identified by the District. MSBA staff continues to work with the District and its consultant team to understand whether the Preferred Schematic is cost-effective.
- 2) The District has submitted an operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget statement for MSBA review.
- 3) MSBA staff’s recommendation to the Board for approval of the District’s Preferred Schematic is contingent upon the District obtaining full ownership, control, and exclusive use of the proposed site. The MSBA will not sign a Project Funding Agreement until said conditions are met.

- 4) The District's Schematic Design submittal will be subject to final review and approval by the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education as part of the Schematic Design submittal, which is prior to executing a Project Scope and Budget Agreement.
- 5) Subject to Board approval, the MSBA will participate in a project that includes spaces that meet MSBA guidelines, except for variations previously agreed to by the MSBA. All proposed spaces will be reviewed during the Schematic Design phase.
- 6) Pursuant to the MSBA's enabling legislation, the MSBA's regulations, and the District's proposed plan to demolish and remove from service the existing East Gloucester Elementary School for which it received a school building grant from the Commonwealth for a prior project, the MSBA may recover a prorated portion of the financial assistance that the District has received for the previous project. Additional information may be required to complete the MSBA's review. The exact amount to be recovered will be established at the conclusion of the Schematic Design phase.
- 7) Pursuant to the MSBA's enabling legislation, the MSBA's regulations, and the District's proposed plan to demolish and replace the existing Veteran's Memorial Elementary School for which it received a school building grant from the Commonwealth for a prior project, the MSBA may recover a prorated portion of the financial assistance that the District has received for the previous project. Additional information may be required to complete the MSBA's review. The exact amount to be recovered will be established at the conclusion of the Schematic Design phase.
- 8) As part of the Schematic Design phase, the District will work with the MSBA to determine a mutually agreeable methodology to differentiate eligible costs from ineligible costs.

Based on the review outlined above, staff recommends that the City of Gloucester be approved to proceed into Schematic Design to replace the existing East Gloucester Elementary School and Veterans Memorial School with a new combined facility serving grades K-5 on the existing Veterans Memorial School site, contingent upon the District gaining full ownership, control, and exclusive use of the site.