

District: Town of Wareham
 School Name: Minot Forest Elementary School
 Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic
 Date: June 20, 2018

Recommendation

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the Town of Wareham, as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to proceed into Schematic Design to replace the existing Minot Forest and John William Decas Elementary Schools with a new facility that will serve grades PK-4 on the existing site of the Minot Forest Elementary School. MSBA staff has reviewed the Feasibility Study and accepts the District’s preferred solution.

District Information	
District Name	Town of Wareham
Elementary School(s)	John William Decas Elementary School (K-2) Minot Forest Elementary School (PK; 3-4)
Middle School(s)	Wareham Middle School (5-8)
High School(s)	Wareham Senior High School (9-12)
Priority School Name	Minot Forest Elementary School
Type of School	Elementary School
Grades Served	PK; 3-4
Year Opened	1966
Existing Square Footage	63,515
Additions	Two-Story Addition - 1973
Acreage of Site	20 acres
Building Issues	<p>The District identified deficiencies in the following areas:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Structural integrity - Mechanical systems - Electrical systems - Envelope - Windows and Roofing - Accessibility <p>In addition to the physical plant issues, the District reported that the existing facility does not support the delivery of its educational program as well as existing and projected overcrowding.</p>
Original Design Capacity	Unknown
2017-2018 Enrollment	490
Agreed Upon Enrollment	<p>Study Enrollment includes the following configurations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 405 students in grades 3-4 at Minot Forest Elementary School; - 1,020 students, District-wide, in grades K-4; Consolidation of the student population of the Minot Forest and Decas Elementary Schools (<i>Preferred Solution</i>).
Enrollment Specifics	Contingent upon the Board’s approval of the preferred solution, the District will sign a Design Enrollment

District Information	
	Certification for 1,020 students in grades K-4, for a project that will serve grades PK-4.
Total Project Budget – Debt Exclusion Anticipated	Yes

MSBA Board Votes	
Invitation to Eligibility Period	January 27, 2016
Invitation to Feasibility Study	February 15, 2017
Preferred Schematic Authorization	On June 27, 2018 Board agenda
Project Scope & Budget Authorization	District is targeting Board authorization on December 12, 2018
Feasibility Study Reimbursement Rate (Incentive points are not applicable)	71.58%

Consultants	
Owner’s Project Manager (the “OPM”)	PMA Consultants
Designer	Mount Vernon Group Architects, Inc.

Discussion

The existing Minot Forest Elementary School is a 63,515 square foot two-story building located on a 20-acre site currently serving grades 3-4. The existing facility was originally constructed in 1966, with an addition constructed in 1973 including eleven classrooms in a two-story arrangement. In addition to the Minot Forest Elementary School, the District evaluated the existing John William Decas Elementary School, located approximately 3.5 miles from the Minot Forest Elementary School. The Decas Elementary School is a 76,095 square foot one-story building located on an 18- acre site and currently serves grades K-2. The Decas Elementary School was constructed in 1968, with a one-story addition constructed in 1973.

The District identified numerous deficiencies in the Statement of Interest for the Minot Forest Elementary School that are associated with: outdated mechanical and electrical systems, non-compliant accessibility conditions, overcrowding, and space constraints inhibiting the District’s ability to deliver its educational program. The District also identified poor energy efficiency performance of the existing facility because of the building envelope, roof conditions, and single pane windows.

As part of the Feasibility Study, the MSBA accepted the District’s request to explore various options associated with the District’s grade K-4 student population, resulting in the following two student enrollment options: 405 students in grades 3 – 4 for Minot only; and 1,020 students, District-wide, in grades K-4. Also, as part of the Feasibility Study, MSBA requested that the District study potential options associated with a District-wide K-3 population that could address District-wide capacity concerns.

In conjunction with its consultants, the District performed a comprehensive assessment of the existing conditions and the educational program and received input from educators, administrators, and facilities personnel. Based on the findings of this effort, the District and its consultants initially studied ten preliminary options that include two base repair options for the

existing buildings, two addition/renovation configurations, and six new construction options, as presented below.

Option	Description of Preliminary Options
MF-X	Renovation Only – Minot Elementary School for 405 students, grades 3-4
D-X	Renovation Only – Decas Elementary School for current PK-2 population
MF-1A	Addition/Renovation to Minot Elementary School for 405 students, grades 3-4
MF-2A	New Construction on Minot Site for 405 students, grades 3-4
MF-1B	Addition/Renovation to Minot Elementary School for 1,020 students, grades PK-4
MF-2B.1	New Construction on Minot Site for 1,020 students, grades PK-4
MF-2B.2	New Construction variation on Minot Site for 1,020 students, grades PK-4
MF-2B.3	New Construction variation on Minot Site for 1,020 students, grades PK-4
MF-2C.1	New Construction on Minot Site for 820 students, grades PK-3
MF-2C.2	New Construction on Minot Site for 820 students, grades PK-3

As a result of further evaluation and refinement, the District determined that the options associated with the grades PK-4 configuration at the Minot Forest Elementary School site best meet the needs of the District’s educational program. The following is a list of the alternative options that were further evaluated:

Option	Description
MF-X/D-X	Capital improvements at the existing Minot Forest Elementary School, for 405 students grades 3-4 and capital improvements at John William Decas Elementary School for the current PK-2 student population.
MF-1B	Addition/Renovation at the existing Minot Forest Elementary School – <i>Two story building (Grades PK-4 – 1,020 Students)</i>
MF-2A	New Construction at the existing Minot Forest Elementary School - (<i>Grades 3-4 – 405 Students</i>) <i>For Cost Comparison Only</i>
MF-2B.1	New Construction at the existing Minot Forest Elementary School – <i>Three story building, rear/south of the site (Grades PK-4 – 1,020 Students)</i>
MF-2B.2	New Construction at the existing Minot Forest Elementary School – <i>Three story building, southeast of the site (Grades PK-4 – 1,020 Students)</i>
MF-2B.3	New Construction at the existing Minot Forest Elementary School – <i>Three story U-Shape building, southeast of the site (Grades PK-4 – 1,020 Students)</i>
MF-2C.1	New Construction at the existing Minot Forest Elementary School – <i>Two story U-Shape building, southeast of the site (Grades PK-3 – 820 Students)</i>
MF-2C.2	New Construction at the existing Minot Forest Elementary School – <i>Three story U-Shape building, southeast of the site (Grades PK-3 – 820 Students)</i>

Upon further review, MSBA staff and the District agreed to nine final options for further development and consideration in the final evaluation and development of preliminary design pricing as presented below. The District determined that “Options D-X, MF-X, and MF-2A” were not viable options and would not be further evaluated because the existing facilities fail to address the desired educational needs of the District while “Option MF-2A” only addresses the issues associated with grades 3-4. Further, the District stated that these options limit alternatives for flexible learning spaces, do not reduce student transitions, and lack the advantages of a single school designed to serve District-wide need for students in grades PK-4. The District determined

that these options do not meet the needs of the District’s educational program, and do not address the issues at the existing Minot Forest Elementary School and John William Decas Elementary School. Although these options were not further evaluated, the estimated cost associated with these options has been provided for cost comparative purposes only.

Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing for Final Evaluation of Options

Option (Description)	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sq. ft.)	Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sq. ft.)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sq. ft.)	Estimated Total Project Costs
Option DX: 'Base Repair Decas'	76,095	76,095 sf \$437/sq. ft.	n/a	\$1,690,476	\$34,919,799 \$459/sq. ft.	\$46,602,147
Option MF-X: 'Base Repair Minot'	63,515	63,515 sf \$303/sq. ft.	n/a	\$1,817,769	\$21,090,009 \$332/sq. ft.	\$27,683,221
Option MF-2A: New Construction; Grades 3-4	82,625	n/a	82,625 sf \$415/sq. ft.	\$5,637,885	\$39,959,576 \$484/sq. ft.	\$50,321,147
Option MF-1B: Addition/ Renovation; Grades PK-4	160,700	59,575 sf \$319/sq. ft.	101,125 sf \$422/sq. ft.	\$5,434,352	\$69,517,081 \$433/sq. ft.	\$89,207,934
Option MF-2B.1: New Construction; Grades PK-4	158,840	n/a	158,840 sf \$395/sq. ft.	\$6,103,092	\$68,882,790 \$434/sq. ft.	\$87,457,290
Option MF-2B.2: New Construction; Grades PK-4	163,180	n/a	163,180 sf \$407/sq. ft.	\$6,256,124	\$72,681,610 \$445/sq. ft.	\$91,996,418
<i>Option MF-2B.3: New Construction; Grades PK-4***</i>	<i>159,100</i>	<i>n/a</i>	<i>159,100 sf \$405/sq. ft.</i>	<i>\$6,785,977</i>	<i>\$71,286,227 \$448/sq. ft.</i>	<i>\$90,254,704</i>
Option MF-2C.1: New Construction; Grades PK-3	135,730	n/a	135,730 sf \$422/sq. ft.	\$6,791,274	\$64,100,490 \$472/sq. ft.	\$80,262,409
Option MF-2C.2: New Construction; Grades PK-3	135,730	n/a	135,730 sf \$422/sq. ft.	\$6,795,597	\$64,135,466 \$473/sq. ft.	\$80,304,405

* Marked up construction costs

** Does not include construction contingency

******District’s preferred solution***

The District has selected “Option MF-2B.3”, a new District-wide PK-4 facility, which replaces both the existing Minot Forest and John William Decas Elementary Schools, on the existing site of the Minot Forest Elementary School, as the preferred solution to proceed into Schematic Design. The District selected this option because it best meets the needs of the District’s educational program, allows the school community to create its desired learning environment for increased student and teacher collaboration in a single PK-4 facility, and provides the District’s desired level of educational flexibility and adaptability.

The District determined that “Option MF-1B” is not viable as it provides limited flexibility of the learning areas, does not fully support the desired educational clustering, provides inadequate connections between breakout areas and the outdoors, has windowless classrooms, and the multi-level configuration requires more vertical circulation than other options studied.

Although, “Options MF-2B.1 and MF-2B.2” meet most of the District’s educational goals, and aligns with MSBA guidelines, the courtyard and circulation patterns for both options are not favored by the District. Furthermore, the District did not select “Options MF-2C.1 and MF-2C.2” because these options do not fully support the educational delivery model and result in a compromised grade configuration that does not align well with the desired grouping of students by grade.

The District presented its proposed project to the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee (“FAS”) on June 6, 2018. At that meeting, members of the FAS raised a number of topics regarding: the District’s educational program and lack of connection to the preferred solution; delivery of the District’s current and future curriculum; the Special Education Program and its relation to the number of proposed spaces; the proposed school scheduling and its impact on the proposed curriculum delivery; circulation and scheduling of the proposed Innovation Hub; logistical challenges regarding student capacity across the District as well as enrollment forecasts; and the budget of the proposed project.

MSBA staff reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study, all subsequent submittals, and the enrollment data with the District and found:

- 1) The MSBA will continue to work with the District in the schematic design phase to further evaluate information associated with projected student population and school facility capacity across the District resulting from the proposed project.
- 2) MSBA reviewed the Feasibility Study and subsequent material and finds that the options investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in scope, the approach undertaken in this study was appropriate, and the District’s preferred solution is reasonable and cost-effective and meets the needs identified by the District.
- 3) The District has submitted an operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget statement for MSBA review.
- 4) The District’s schematic design submittal will be subject to final review and approval by the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education as part of the schematic design submittal prior to a Project Scope and Budget Agreement.
- 5) Subject to Board approval, the MSBA will participate in a project that includes spaces that meet MSBA guidelines, with the exception of variations previously agreed to by the MSBA. All proposed spaces will be reviewed during the Schematic Design phase.
- 6) As part of the Schematic Design phase, the District will work with the MSBA to determine a mutually agreeable methodology to differentiate eligible costs from ineligible costs.

Based on the review outlined above, staff recommends that the Town of Wareham be approved to proceed into Schematic Design to replace the existing Minot Forest and Decas Elementary

Schools with a new PK-4 elementary school facility on the existing Minot Forest Elementary School site.