

District: Town of Millis
 School Name: Clyde F. Brown Elementary School
 Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic
 Date: September 21, 2016

Recommendation

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the Town of Millis, as part of its invitation to Feasibility Study, to proceed into Schematic Design to replace the existing Clyde F. Brown Elementary School with a new grades PK-5 elementary school on the existing site.

MSBA staff has reviewed the Feasibility Study and accepts the District’s preferred solution.

District Information	
District Name	Town of Millis (the “Town”)
Elementary School(s)	Clyde F. Brown Elementary School (PK-4)
Middle School(s)	Millis Middle School (5-8)
High School(s)	Millis High School (9-12)
Priority School Name	Clyde F. Brown Elementary School
Type of School	Elementary School
Grades Served	PK-4
Year Opened	1954
Existing Square Footage	67,210
Additions	In 1991, a 48,000 sq. ft. addition for grades 3-5 was attached to the existing K-2 elementary school. A new gym was added along with a cafeteria, kitchen, library, pupil personnel services suite, and 21 general classrooms.
Acreage of Site	6.6 acres
Building Issues	The District identified deficiencies in the following areas: Deficient mechanical, electrical & plumbing systems Lack of fire protection systems and controls Deficient roof & windows Inefficient envelope and systems Lack of accessibility for the handicapped In addition to the physical plant issues, the District reported that the existing facility does not support the delivery of its educational program as well as existing and projected overcrowding. Non-traditional learning spaces are in use and there is a lack of space reserved for special education. Some teachers must share classrooms and the building’s network does not support technology.
Original Design Capacity	Unknown
2015-2016 Enrollment	528
Agreed Upon Enrollment	Study Enrollment includes the following configurations: 425 students for grades K-4

District Information	
	515 students for grades K-5 (Preferred solution)
Enrollment Specifics	Contingent upon the Board's approval of the preferred solution, the District and MSBA have mutually agreed upon a design enrollment of 515 students for grades K-5, for a project that will serve grades PK-5.

MSBA Board Votes	
Invitation to Eligibility Period	June 4, 2014
Invitation to Feasibility Study	March 25, 2015
Preferred Schematic Authorization	On September 28, 2016 Board agenda
Project Scope & Budget Authorization	District is targeting Board authorization on May 10, 2017
Feasibility Study Reimbursement Rate (Incentives points are not applicable)	51.42%

Consultants	
Owner's Project Manager	Compass Project Management, Inc.
Designer	Tappe Architects

Discussion

As part of the Feasibility Study, MSBA staff agreed with the District's request to explore a study design enrollment of 425 students for grades K-4 and a study design enrollment of 515 students for grades K-5.

The existing Clyde F. Brown Elementary School is a 67,210 square foot facility that currently serves students in grades PK-4. The original school building was constructed in 1954, with an addition built in 1991. The site consists of six parcels totaling 24.46 acres of land, which are situated within a larger Town-owned property in the center of the Town. This site includes the Town Hall, Middle/High School, and a Town park that shares fields with the schools. The District's Statement of Interest ("SOI") identified numerous deficiencies in the existing facility associated with overcrowding, outdated mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems, non-compliant accessibility conditions, and the appropriateness of the existing spaces to deliver its educational program.

In conjunction with its consultants, the District performed a comprehensive assessment of the existing conditions and the educational program of the Clyde F. Brown Elementary School and received input from educators, administrators, and facilities personnel. Based on the findings of this effort, the District and its consultants initially studied 12 preliminary options that include:

one code upgrade option, two addition/renovation configurations, and nine new construction options. In addition to the existing site and surrounding parcels, the study analyzed three alternative sites. There is local support to move the fifth grade back into the elementary grade facility because of overcrowding in the existing Middle/High School. Therefore, the community expressed particular support for the grade PK-5 options. Additionally, at the most recent annual Town Meeting, Millis residents voted, in principal, to support a transfer of current park land to the School Department. It is anticipated that the Town will formally approve the land transfer at the Fall Town Meeting, with an Article 97 legislative vote early in 2017. The following is a detailed list of the preliminary alternatives considered.

Option	Description of Preliminary Options
1A.1	Code upgrade renovation to the existing school (Grades PK-4; 425 students)
1A.2	Partial demolition, additions and renovations of the existing school (Grades PK-5; 515 students)
1A.3	Additions and renovations to the existing school (Grades PK-5; 515 students)
1B.1	New Construction on the “knoll” portion of the existing site, which extends into the Town’s recreation property (Grades PK-5; 515 students)
1B.2	New Construction on the “knoll” portion of the existing site, which extends into the Town’s recreation property (Grades PK-5; 515 students)
1B.3	New Construction on the “knoll” portion of the existing site, which extends into the Town’s recreation property (Grades PK-5; 515 students)
1C.1	New Construction on the southeast side of the adjacent Town owned recreation fields (Grades PK-5; 515 students)
1C.2	New Construction on the southeast side of the adjacent Town owned recreation fields (Grades PK-5; 515 students)
1C.3	New Construction on the southeast side of the adjacent Town owned recreation fields (Grades PK-5; 515 students)
2	New Construction located on the Ridge Street site (Grades PK-5; 515 students)
3	New Construction located on the 1073 Main Street site (Grades PK-5; 515 students)
4	New Construction located on the Cassidy site (Grades PK-5; 515 students)

Following that analysis, it was determined that the following options would not be considered for further evaluation:

- Option 1A.3, due to inability to deliver the District’s Educational Program and accommodate a PK-5 enrollment.
- Option 1B.1, due to required phased construction approach, disruption to the students, extended construction duration, and cost of the proposed project.

- Option 1B.3, due to required extensive site work and challenges associated with accommodating construction activities and traffic on a limited area.
- Option 1C.1, due to required lack of proximity to the Middle/High School, circulation conflicts with the Town Hall, and increased traffic on Spring Street.
- Option 1C.2, due to required extended construction duration and cost of the proposed project, circulation conflicts with the Town Hall, and limited site area for outdoor school programs.
- Option 2, on the Ridge Street site, due to the extent and complexity of the site development, limited buildable area, and cost of the property.
- Option 3, on the 1073 Main Street site, due to existing industrial construction, potential site contamination, cost of the property, and related demolition and abatement requirements.
- Option 4, on the Town owned Cassidy property, due to Town conservation restrictions, wetland setbacks, and limited buildable area.

Upon further review, MSBA staff and the District agreed to four final options for further development and consideration in the final evaluation and development of preliminary design pricing, as presented below.

Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing for Final Evaluation of Options

Option: Description	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sf)	Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sf)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sf)	Estimated Total Project Costs
Option 1A.1: Code upgrade renovation to the existing school (Grades K-4; 425 students)	67,210	67,210 \$318/sf	N/A	\$1,515,636	\$22,918,062 \$341/sf	\$34,276,000
Option 1A.2: Partial demolition, additions and renovations of the existing school (Grades PK-5; 515 students)	84,928	32,714 \$387/sf	52,214 \$411/sf	\$6,790,586	\$40,900,641 \$482/sf	\$53,235,000
<i>Option 1B.2: New construction on the existing site (Grades PK-5; 515 students)***</i>	<i>91,644</i>	<i>N/A</i>	<i>91,644 \$381/sf</i>	<i>\$8,374,291</i>	<i>\$43,260,078 \$472/sf</i>	<i>\$54,559,000</i>
Option 1C.3: New construction on the southeast side of the adjacent Town owned recreation fields (Grades PK-5; 515 students)	91,644	N/A	91,644 \$379/sf	\$8,360,634	\$43,057,865 \$470/sf	\$54,317,000

* Marked up construction costs

** Does not include construction contingency

****District's preferred option*

The District has selected “Option 1B.2”, which replaces the existing Clyde F. Brown Elementary School with a new grades PK-5 facility on the existing site as the preferred solution to proceed into Schematic Design. The District selected this option as its preferred solution because it meets the needs of the District’s Educational Program and the proposed site offers opportunities for outdoor learning areas, improved traffic patterns, and additional play areas.

Option 1A.1 was not selected as the District’s preferred option because it does not meet the needs of the District’s Educational Program, it does not fulfill a major District goal of moving the 5th grade back into the elementary school, and phasing was seen as significantly disruptive. Option 1A.2 was not selected as the District’s preferred option because, due to existing site constraints, the building does not accommodate three distinct small learning communities within the building, the goal of a distributed media center is not achieved, and the phasing and construction are seen as significantly disruptive. Finally, although Option 1C.3 meets the needs of the District’s Educational Program and the phasing is the least disruptive of the four options, this option was not selected as the District’s preferred option because residents of abutting properties expressed concern about the proximity of the proposed building. In addition, traffic patterns were a concern for the community. Also, there were community concerns regarding the loss of a ball field for the duration of construction and the time needed to construct a new ball field.

The District presented its proposed project to the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee (the “FAS”) on August 24, 2016. At that meeting, the FAS, MSBA staff, and the District discussed the following:

- The project schedule and potential impact associated with an Article 97 land transfer for both options 1B.2 and 1C.3;
- How the preferred option vehicular drives, parking and drop of areas, and pedestrian access areas function;
- The operation and administration of the early childhood extended day care program, how it differs from the PK functions, and how the spaces will be used during the school day;
- Distribution of special education spaces;
- Handicap accessibility and shelter at drop off locations;
- Involvement of facility management staff and safety officials throughout the project;
- Safety and storage of materials and supplies for the art program and maker spaces;
- Selection of instructional materials for the media center collection;
- Maintenance of outdoor spaces and gardens during the summer;
- Use of mechanized gym partitions; and
- Security and visibility of students entering the school from the bus drop off area.

MSBA staff reviewed the conclusions derived from the Feasibility Study, all subsequent submittals, and the enrollment data with the District and found:

- The options investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in scope, the approach undertaken in this study was appropriate, and the District’s preferred solution is reasonable, cost effective, and meets the needs identified by the District;

- The District has submitted an operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget statement for MSBA review;
- The District's Schematic Design submittal will be subject to final review and approval by the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education, prior to the execution of a Project Scope and Budget Agreement;
- Subject to Board approval, the MSBA will participate in a project that complies with MSBA space guidelines, with the exception of variations previously agreed to by the MSBA. All proposed spaces will be reviewed during the Schematic Design phase; and
- As part of the Schematic Design phase, the District will work with the MSBA to determine a mutually agreeable methodology to differentiate eligible costs from ineligible costs.

Based on the review outlined above, MSBA staff recommends that the Town of Millis be approved to proceed into Schematic Design to replace the existing Clyde F. Brown Elementary School with a new grades PK-5 elementary school on the existing site.