

District: City of Lynn
 School Name: Pickering Middle School
 Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic
 Date: November 2, 2016

Recommendation

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the City of Lynn, as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to proceed into Schematic Design to replace the existing Pickering Middle School facility with two new middle school buildings on two different sites (the “Preferred Solution”). MSBA staff has reviewed the Feasibility Study and accepts the District’s preferred solution.

District Information	
District Name	City of Lynn
Elementary Schools	Six Schools (PK-5) Nine Schools (K-5) Four Schools (1-5)
Middle Schools	Breed Middle School (6-8) Pickering Middle School (6-8) Thurgood Marshall Middle School (6-8)
High Schools	Fecteau-Leary Junior/Senior High School (7-12) Classical High School (9-12) Lynn English High School (9-12) Lynn Vocational Technical High School (9-12)
Priority School Name	Pickering Middle School
Type of School	Middle School
Grades Served	6-8
Year Opened	1917
Existing Square Footage	78,600
Additions	Addition made in 1953 when an adjacent building was constructed and the electrical, plumbing and HVAC systems were shared
Acreage of Site	5.01 acres
Building Issues	The District identified deficiencies in the following areas: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Mechanical, Electrical, and Plumbing systems - Building Envelope, Windows, and Roof - Accessibility In addition to the physical plant issues, the District reported that the existing facility does not support the delivery of its educational program as well as existing and projected overcrowding.
Original Design Capacity	Unknown
2015-2016 Enrollment	618
Agreed Upon Enrollment	1,660
Enrollment Specifics	The District and MSBA have mutually agreed upon a design enrollment of 1,660 students serving grades 6-8.

MSBA Board Votes	
Invitation to Eligibility Period	January 14, 2015

Invitation to Feasibility Study	August 6, 2015
Preferred Schematic Authorization	On November 9, 2016 Board agenda
Project Scope & Budget Authorization	District is targeting Board authorization on February 15, 2017
Feasibility Study Reimbursement Rate (Incentives points are not applicable)	79.58%

Consultants	
Owner's Project Manager (the "OPM")	LEFTFIELD, LLC
Designer	Raymond Design Associates, Inc.

Discussion

The existing Pickering Middle School is a 78,600 square foot building located on a five-acre site. The existing facility was originally constructed in 1907 and currently serves grades 6-8. It should be noted that the existing Sisson Elementary School was attached to the Pickering Middle School in 1953 and currently serves grades K-5.

The District identified numerous deficiencies in the Statement of Interest that are associated with severe overcrowding and space constraints inhibiting the District's ability to deliver its educational program. The District also identified current building envelope conditions contributing to poor energy efficiency performance. In addition, outdated mechanical, electrical and plumbing systems, non-compliant accessibility, and damage due to water infiltration all contribute to the deficiencies of the existing facility.

In conjunction with its consultants, the District performed a comprehensive assessment of the existing conditions and the educational program and received input from educators, administrators, and facilities personnel. The District considered thirteen sites as part of its preliminary evaluation, as listed below:

Location	Site Description
1	Existing Pickering Middle School Site
2	Magnolia Park (within Pickering District)
3	Reservoir/ Parkland Avenue (within Pickering District)
4	Union Hospital Site (within Pickering District)
5	Gallagher Park (within Pickering District)
6	Rockdale Avenue Site (within Pickering District)
7	Federal Street Site (within West Lynn)
8	General Electric Site at Elmwood Avenue (within West Lynn)
9	General Electric Site at Bennett Street (within West Lynn)
10	General Electric Site at Athletic Association Park (within West Lynn)
11	Barry Park (within West Lynn)
12	McManus Park (within West Lynn)
13	Existing Breed Middle School Site (within Breed District)

Of the six sites within the Pickering District, the District considered sites at the existing Pickering Middle School, Gallagher Park, and the Reservoir/Park Avenue to be viable locations and further evaluated these three sites. Of the six sites within West Lynn, the District considered the McManus Park site to be a viable location and further evaluated this site. The existing Breed Middle School site was also considered to be a viable location and was further evaluated.

Based on the findings of this effort, the District and its consultants initially considered nine preliminary options that include multiple addition/renovation and new construction options, and one base repair option. It is important to note that the preliminary scenarios evaluated for addition/renovation and new construction options involved consideration of multiple sites with various breakdowns of the design enrollment of 1,660, as outlined in the design enrollment certification, leading to the evaluation of five single-school options and four two-school options.

Option	Description of Preliminary Options (with corresponding design enrollment)
1	Base Repair at existing Pickering (652)
2	Addition/Renovation at existing Pickering (652)
2A	Addition/Renovation at existing Pickering (1,660)
3	New W. Lynn at McManus Park (1,008)/ Add/reno at existing Pickering (652)
3A	New W. Lynn at McManus Park (1,008)/ New Pickering at Magnolia Park (652)
4	New Pickering at Reservoir Site (1,008)/ Add/reno at existing Breed MS (1,660)
5	New Pickering at Gallagher Park (1,660)
5A	New Pickering at Reservoir Site (1,660)
6	New W. Lynn at McManus Park (1,008)/ New Pickering at Reservoir Site (652)

The addition/renovation options at the existing Pickering Middle School facility were not recognized by the District as viable options for this project because of the site constraints and the desire to eventually repurpose the Pickering Middle School facility as an expanded Sisson Elementary School, in an effort to relieve overcrowding within the elementary school grades. MSBA staff and the District agreed to five options for further development and consideration in the final evaluation and development of preliminary design pricing, as presented below. Although the 'Base Repair' option was not considered to be a viable option for this project, preliminary pricing is included for comparison.

Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing for Final Evaluation of Options

Option (Description)	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sf)	Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sf)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat, Takings, Swing Space, Transport Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sf)	Estimated Total Project Costs
<u>Option 1 (Totals):</u> Base Repair at the existing Pickering Middle School	98,798 sf	98,798 sf \$246.10/sf	N/A	\$6,985,663	\$31,299,372 \$316.80/sf	\$39,593,705

Option (Description)	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sf)	Square Feet of New Constructi on (cost*/sf)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat, Takings, Swing Space, Transport Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sf)	Estimated Total Project Costs
<u>Option 3A (Totals):</u> Option 3A.1+3A.2	313,172 sf	N/A	313,172 \$417.17/sf	\$14,070,765	\$144,905,143 \$462.70/sf	\$183,305,006
<u>Option 3A.1:</u> New construction of a 1,008 student West Lynn Middle School at the McManus Site	181,847 sf	N/A	181,847 sf \$390.28/sf	\$6,066,022	\$77,036,514 \$423.63/sf	\$97,451,190
<u>Option 3A.2:</u> New construction of a 652 student Pickering Middle School at the Magnolia Park Site	131,325 sf	N/A	131,325 sf \$455.84/sf	\$8,004,743	\$67,868,629 \$516.80/sf	\$85,853,816
<u>Option 4 (Totals):</u> Option 4.1+4.2	439,745 sf	173,635 sf \$162.72/sf	266,110 sf \$399.90/sf	\$20,451,379	\$155,123,034 \$352.76/sf	\$195,024,782
<u>Option 4.1:</u> New construction of a 1,008 student Pickering Middle School at the Reservoir Site	181,847 sf	N/A	181,847 sf \$411.24/sf	\$16,695,136	\$91,478,495 \$503.05/sf	\$114,535,640
<u>Option 4.2:</u> Addition/renovation at the existing Breed Middle School for 1,660 students	257,898 sf	173,635 sf \$162.72/sf	84,263 \$375.43/sf	\$3,756,243	\$63,644,539 \$246.78/sf	\$80,489,142
<u>Option 5A (Totals):</u> New construction of a 1,660 student Pickering Middle School at the Gallagher Park Site	293,997 sf	N/A	293,997 sf \$418.18/sf	\$7,205,359	\$130,149,831 \$442.69/sf	\$164,639,536
<u>Option 5B (Totals):</u> New construction of a 1,660 student Pickering Middle School at the Reservoir Site	293,997 sf	N/A	293,997 sf \$406.08/sf	\$19,486,598	\$138,873,976 \$472.37/sf	\$174,490,924
<u>Option 6 (Totals):</u> <u>Option 6.1+6.2***</u>	<i>313,172 sf</i>	<i>N/A</i>	<i>313,172 sf</i> <i>\$395.20/sf</i>	<i>\$22,069,090</i>	<i>\$145,835,940</i> <i>\$465.67/sf</i>	<i>\$183,297,809</i>
<u>Option 6.1:</u> <i>New construction of a 1,008 student West Lynn Middle School at the McManus Site</i>	<i>181,847 sf</i>	<i>N/A</i>	<i>181,847</i> <i>\$388.94/sf</i>	<i>\$6,045,364</i>	<i>\$76,773,534</i> <i>\$422.19/sf</i>	<i>\$97,118,521</i>

Option (Description)	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sf)	Square Feet of New Constructi on (cost*/sf)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat, Takings, Swing Space, Transport Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sf)	Estimated Total Project Costs
<i>Option 6.2:</i> <i>New construction of a 652 student Pickering Middle School at the Reservoir Site</i>	131,325 sf	N/A	131,325 \$403.88/sf	\$16,023,726	\$69,062,406 \$525.89/sf	\$86,179,288

* Marked up construction costs
 ** Does not include construction contingency
 *** District's preferred option

To relieve the current overcrowding issues, the District determined that providing four middle schools within the City of Lynn is necessary to enable the District to provide educational parity and to deliver its desired program. Based on this determination, the District has selected “Option 6” as the preferred solution to proceed into Schematic Design. This option is reported to address existing deficiencies and provide relief for existing and projected overcrowding at the existing Breed Middle School and will have the least amount of disruption to students during construction.

“Option 6” proposes to increase the number of middle schools in Lynn from three to four and will allow the District to deliver its desired educational program equally across the District in a more geographically efficient manner. As a result of the proposed solution, the District’s middle school facilities will include the existing Breed Middle School, the recently constructed Thurgood Marshall Middle School, the proposed new Pickering Middle School, and the proposed new West Lynn Middle School. The District proposes to re-use the design of the recently constructed Thurgood Marshall Middle School for the new West Lynn Middle School, which is anticipated to realize a savings associated with consultant fees and result in a shorter design phase.

Although “Option 3A” proposes to address the same overcrowding and educational issues as proposed in the preferred solution “Option 6”, the District found the location at Magnolia Park to be less advantageous due to the existing site shape and soil properties, anticipated increase to neighborhood traffic, and long permitting process. Similarly, “Option 4” was not considered further because the addition to the existing Breed Middle School would add significant traffic to a neighborhood where a high school and elementary school currently exist in close proximity. In addition, “Option 4” was considered to be less-efficient because the existing Breed Middle School is located a considerable distance from the densely populated area of West Lynn.

“Option 5”, which proposes a one-school solution, was not considered further given the District’s desire to not displace the heavily-used active recreation space associated with Gallagher Park. Finally, “Option 5A”, also a one-school solution, was not considered further as the District’s desire to provide a facility for the middle school population within West Lynn provides a significant programmatic and geographical advantage by allowing for a smaller facility at the Reservoir/Parkland Avenue site that is more suitable for the student population in that section of the City.

The District presented its preferred solution to the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee (“FAS”) on October 13, 2016. At that meeting, MSBA staff, members of the FAS, and the District discussed: the proposed location of special education spaces and the importance of locating special education space all throughout the school, increasing District-wide enrollment, a potential reduction in designer and OPM fees associated with utilizing the Thurgood Marshall Middle School design for the West Lynn project, scheduling and the potential for ‘teams’ to create their own class schedules, the size of the proposed science classroom/labs, safe occupant capacity, opportunities to create a second means of egress for the science rooms, limited access to science preparation rooms, project area spaces, and suggestions for opening some of the science rooms into adjacent spaces. Also discussed was the potential benefit of creating ‘buffer zones’ to assist in the management of the size of the school district, future and proposed use of the play fields associated with McManus Park, and the project schedule as it relates to the District’s readiness for submitting a Schematic Design to the MSBA in early January 2017. The District and the FAS members also discussed: the local permitting and approval processes that are associated with land ownership and the potential impact on the timing of a Project Funding Agreement, the presence of vernal pools at the Reservoir Street site, community opposition to locating a new school building at the Reservoir Street site, the historic documentation related to ownership and title of land associated with the proposed sites, and securing access and control of the proposed site in a timely manner.

MSBA staff reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study, all subsequent submittals, and the enrollment data with the District and found:

- 1) The options investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in scope, the approach undertaken in this study was appropriate, and the District’s preferred solution is reasonable, cost-effective, and meets the needs identified by the District.
- 2) The District has submitted an operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget statement for MSBA review.
- 3) The District’s Schematic Design submittal will be subject to final review and approval by the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education as part of the Schematic Design submittal process prior to a Project Scope and Budget Agreement.
- 4) Subject to Board approval, the MSBA will continue to participate in a project that includes spaces that meet MSBA guidelines, with the exception of variations previously agreed to by the MSBA. All proposed spaces will be reviewed during the Schematic Design phase.
- 5) As part of the Schematic Design phase, the MSBA will continue to work with the District to understand the approach and complexity of producing documentation associated with the proposed two-school solution, including but not limited to: site ownership and control, community and local regulatory requirements, multiple project budgets and contracts, and the project schedule.
- 6) As part of the Schematic Design phase, the MSBA will continue to work with the District to determine a mutually agreeable methodology to differentiate eligible costs from ineligible costs, especially given the anticipated complexity associated with the proposed two-school solution.

Based on the review outlined above, MSBA staff recommends that the City of Lynn be approved to proceed into Schematic Design to replace the existing Pickering Middle School facility with two new middle school buildings on two different sites.