

District: Woburn
School Name: Goodyear Elementary School
Category: Feasibility Study

Recommendation:

That the Executive Director is authorized to approve Woburn, as part of its Invitation for Feasibility Study, to proceed into schematic design for the construction of a new Elementary School on the site of the existing Goodyear Elementary School.

Background:

The Goodyear Elementary School, the district's prioritized Statement of Interest, was built in 1927. The main building of the existing Goodyear Elementary School is approximately 26,990 gross square feet, and there are 4 modular units. The current enrollment is 215 students. The District identified a number of building issues associated with the school, including deterioration and ventilation issues with its four portable classrooms, ineffective ventilation within the 1927 building, the HVAC system is outdated, the 1960's roof is in need of replacement, there are a lack of handicap facilities, window replacement is necessary throughout the entire building, and its interior walls, floors, and ceilings are all in need of replacement. In addition to the physical plant issues, the District identified programmatic deficiencies including educational programs that are held in converted janitor storage areas with poor ventilation, heat, and lighting as well as, due to overcrowding, the need to relocate the Library from a 900 sq. ft. classroom to a 400 sq. ft. classroom, providing no space for instruction.

The MSBA Board approved staff's recommendation to issue an invitation to feasibility study to Woburn to further study the problems identified at the Goodyear Elementary School. The District believes that the only viable solution is to construct a new Goodyear Elementary School on the existing site.

The District had performed a Feasibility Study, dated December 1, 2005, by Tappe Associates that determined that the Goodyear School needs to be replaced. The study also determined that consolidating two older, smaller, schools in poor condition into one new, larger facility was the most cost effective solution for the Goodyear School. Specifically, replacing the Goodyear Elementary and Clapp Elementary (an elementary school which also needs to be replaced) with a single larger Goodyear Elementary School was the most cost effective and educationally appropriate solution. Based on the MSBA's review of the 2005 Tappe study, the district was directed to target alternatives which compared solutions for constructing a single new elementary school to replace the existing Goodyear Elementary School as well as a single new elementary school that would replace the Goodyear Elementary School and the Clapp Elementary School on a site within the City of Woburn.

Discussion:

In 1999, the City of Woburn commissioned Flansburgh Associates to evaluate options for upgrading and modernizing the City's nine elementary schools. Based on this study, the City has constructed three new elementary schools since 2000 and has commissioned another study. The 2005 Tappe study confirmed the conclusions from the earlier 1999 Flansburgh study.

The District's goal is to replace its older buildings and combine its small elementary schools for better efficiencies in delivering its educational program as well as optimizing its operating budget. The 2005 Tappe study also evaluated options to consolidate the remaining six elementary schools into three elementary schools and found that replacing the Goodyear and Clapp with a single larger Goodyear Elementary School was the most cost effective and educationally appropriate solution for the City. The 2005 Tappe study evaluated two primary options:

- Option A – Consolidate the remaining six elementary schools into three elementary schools
- Option B – Renovate and additions to each of the schools

The Tappe study concluded that Option A was the preferred option and specifically for the Goodyear Elementary School that combining the students from the Clapp and Goodyear students into a single new elementary was the most cost effective solution. The study also identified a designated portion of the Leland Park site as a potential site for the new combined elementary school.

Recently the District has procured an Owner's Project Manager (Municipal Building Systems) and a Designer (Tappe Associates Inc.), to continue their pursuit of a new Goodyear Elementary School as recommended in the Prior Study. To confirm conclusions reached in the 2005 study, the Designer developed updated renovation layouts and square foot requirements to reflect the educational needs of today and the current design enrollment. The OPM incorporated the updated square footage requirements and cost estimates to compare the costs of renovation and addition to the existing schools versus replacement with a single new school as shown below.

- Total Construction Cost for Larger Goodyear School to replace the two existing schools - \$20,304,427
- Total Construction Cost for Renovating/Addition to the Clapp and Goodyear Elementary Schools - \$25,642,075

Based on the 2005 Tappe study, the District continued to investigate use of the Leland Park site for a potential new school. During these site investigations, hazardous materials were discovered on the Leland Park site which prompted a new city wide search for a potential site. This Study yielded the existing Goodyear Elementary School site as the only available site. The Designer has investigated the existing site of the Goodyear Elementary School and has found it to be suitable.

MSBA staff has reviewed the conclusions of the 2005 Tappe study, the Feasibility Study Update Report and the enrollment data with the District and finds:

- 1) All initial paperwork required has been processed including an executed Initial Certificate of Compliance and the composition of the School Building Committee for MSBA approval.
- 2) MSBA has completed an enrollment projection utilizing the enrollment questionnaire completed by Woburn, a review of the use and capacity at the Clapp and Goodyear Elementary schools, School Committee support for the redistricting needed to move 50 students from the Clapp Elementary School into the Reeves School and all remaining students into the Goodyear Elementary School District, and an updated status of development under construction in the District. The MSBA and the District have agreed on a design enrollment of 320 students for a new Goodyear Elementary School on the existing site.
- 3) MSBA reviewed Woburn's 2005 Tappe study and finds that the options studied are reasonable and its conclusions are acceptable to the extent that they determined that the Goodyear needs to be replaced.
- 4) MSBA reviewed the Feasibility Study Update Report, dated April 2009 and finds that the constructing a single facility on the existing site is more cost effective than renovating and providing additions to the existing facilities.

Based on the review outlined above, staff recommends that Woburn be approved to proceed into schematic design for the construction of a new Goodyear Elementary School on the existing site to replace the existing Clapp and Goodyear Elementary Schools.